THE DO'S AND DONT'S OF GOOD JUDGING

"FROM THOSE WHO HAVE BEEN THERE DONE THAT"

Tennessee Judicial Conference Murfreesboro, TN March 18, 2015



Sponsored by: RETIRED JUDGES COMMITTEE

Presenters:

JUDGE D. J. ALISSANDRATOS

JUDGE BILL ACREE

JUDGE EDDIE BECKNER, CHAIRPERSON

JUDGE THOMAS "SKIP" FRIERSON

JUDGE RICHARD LADD

JUDGE CAROL SOLOMAN

AGENDA

Introduction
Pretrial Preparation
Summary Judgment
Enforcing the Rules
Judicial Struggles
Contempt
Self-Represented Litigants
Pretrial Preparation
"Keeping Your Sense of
Humor"
Q & A

Judge Eddie Beckner

Judge Richard Ladd Judge Bill Acree Judge Carol Soloman Judge D. J. Alissandratos Judge Skip Frierson Judge Eddie Beckner

Judge Eddie Beckner



PRETRIAL PREPARATION SUMMARY JUDGMENT



JUDGE RICHARD LADD

Tips on Ruling From the Bench

Prepare the Bar

- 1. Adopt a local Rule on filing deadline for Pretrial Briefs.
- 2. Announce your intent to rule from the bench at docket soundings, bar meetings, bar newsletters.

Prepare for Trial

- 1. Read the court file.
- 2. Read the trial briefs and attachments.
- 3. Read and copy any applicable jury instruction and statute(s). Pattern Jury Instructions is a great place find the necessary elements of a cause of action.

At Trial

- 1. Make notes of key testimony as to elements of the cause of action and elements of the defense.
- 2. At end of proof and argument take a recess and organize your notes and outline your findings of fact.
- 3. Compare your findings of fact with the elements of the cause of action and defenses as well as any involves statutes.
- 4. Outline you findings of law.
- 5. Outline you decision.
- 6. Announce your decision, and ask the attorney for the prevailing party to prepare a judgment.
- 7. If a multi-day trial, organize your notes after each day of trial.

If you can rule from the bench, you will find your mind is more clear for the next case, and you can avoid placing the court file on the TO DO PILE in your office.

If you have questions or comments, you may contact me at <u>bristolladds@yahoo.com</u>, or 423-764-2744 or cell 423-676-3069.

Richard E. Ladd

125 Lick Branch Rd.

Bristol, TN 37620

Do's:

- 1. Remember you are a servant of the people. Everyone stands when you enter the courtroom not because of YOU, but for the office you represent.
- 2. Be prompt and consistent. For example: start court at 9 AM, break at 10:30 for fifteen minutes; lunch 12 to 1; break at 3 and recess at 5. Set your watch at breaks because 15 minutes can go fast if someone is waiting to see you as you get off the bench.
- 3. Treat court clerks, court officers, and other courthouse employees as you would like to be treated if you were in their place.
- 4. Make a special effort to make jurors feel at ease and comfortable. It is to your benefit since most are registered voters.
- 5. Be prepared for your day in court. If practical, be familiar with the days court files.
- 6. If a complicated case in a bench trial, copy a Jury Instruction for the case and have it on the bench to refer to as the proof develops. In this way you can see the strength and weaknesses of each partie's proof.
- 7. Rule on objections in a confident manner as quickly as possible. If you need a few seconds to think, ask the attorney who makes the objection to cite the number of the Evidence Rules which supports his position.
- 8. It is best if you have a rule that an attorney says no more than "I Object" and require the attorneys to approach the bench to explain why they are objecting so the jury does not hear what they say. A "Speaking Objection" and a "Speaking Response" can easily lead to inadmissible evidence being heard by the jury.
- 9. Be firm but fair in your rulings during the trial. Make every effort to be civil in you statements and rulings even when a lawyer is acting like an idiot. In other words it is O.K. to be a S.O.B., but be a nice, pleasant S.O.B.
- 10. If a jury trial, set limits on opening and closing arguments with a one minute warning before an attorney's time is up. Have clear rules on what an attorney can cover in Closing Argument.
- 11. If you are trying a complicated bench trial, take a break after the proof and final arguments to review your notes and organize your thoughts, and then go back on the bench announce you decision in the case. Only as a last option should you ever take a case "under advisement". You are only fooling yourself if you think it will be easier to give a decision at a later date. Do not put your decision off to wait on post trial briefs from counsel. Do have a local rule to have trial briefs submitted to the Court before the trial.
- 12. The parties and the lawyers are not really interested in your writing skills. What the parties and the lawyers want most of all is a DECISION. They have lived with the case for months and at times years, and they will appreciate most an ending by YOU making a Ruling.
- 13. Have a local rule on who prepares the Judgment and when it must be submitted.
- 14. If you wish and if a court reporter is present in a bench trial, you may make a detailed finding of facts to be transcribed by the reporter and filed with the Judgement.

- 15. Be prompt in ruling on all post trial Motions and entry of Orders from the motions.
- 16. Be prompt, pleasant, consistent, and firm, and your days in court will be rewarding and successful.

ENFORCING THE RULES



JUDGE BILL ACREE

ENFORCING THE RULES

Role of the Trial Judges

As our Supreme Court has noted, the role of the trial judge is not to act as a referee, but to exercise its discretion to promote justice and avoid injustice. <u>Iloube v. Caine</u>, 397 S.W.3d 597 (Tenn.Ct.App. 2012)

Purpose of Sanctions

The sanctions addressed in Tenn.R.Civ.P. 37.02 serve a three-fold purpose: (1) to secure a party's compliance with the discovery rules, (2) to deter other litigants from violating discovery rules and (3) to punish parties who violate discovery rules. <u>Burnette v. Sundeen</u>, 152 S.W 3d 1 (Tenn.Ct. App. 2004)

Although the Tennessee Rules of Civil Procedure do not specify a sanction to be imposed when a party fails to identify an expert witness in her discovery answers, our Supreme Court found that "the inherent power of trial judges permits the trial judge to take appropriate corrective action against a party for discovery abuse. <u>Llyle v. Exxon Corp.</u>, 746 S.W2d 694, 699 (Tenn. 1988)

In reviewing the inquiry that trial judges should make when determining the appropriate sanction, the Lyle court set forth the following considerations:

- 1. The explanation given for failure to name the witness;
- 2. The importance of the testimony of the witness;
- 3. The need of time to prepare to meet the testimony; and
- 4. The possibility of a continuance.

Buckner v. Hassell, 44 S.W.3d 78 (Tenn.Ct.App. 2000)

Inherent Power to Impose Sanctions

As we have further observed, however, the inherent powers of the court to impose sanctions are most effective when utilized with discretion and restrain. Id. "The punishment must fit the offense." Id. "The power to sanction should be used sparingly. It should not be used like a sword and used frequently . . . to do so would diminish the significance when sanctions are imposed." Id. Thus, although dismissal is appropriate where there has been intentional disregard of the trial court's orders where a party has "flout[ed]" the court's discovery order, it is a drastic measure which the court wisely imposes with discretion. Peques v. Illinois Cent. R. Co., 288 S.W. 3d 350 (Tenn. Ct. App. 2008)

Authority Under the Rules to Impose Sanctions

11.03 TRCP

36.01 TRCP

37 TRCP

56.08 TRCP

Scope of Appellate Review of Sanctions

Our trial courts possess broad discretionary authority to control their dockets and the proceedings in their courts. *Hessmer*, 138 S.W.3d at 904, and the Appellate Courts do not disturb the exercise of such discretion unless the trial court has acted unreasonably, arbitrarily, or unconscionably. *Hodges v. Attorney Gen.*, 43 S.W. 3d 918, 921 (Tenn.Ct. App. 2000). Further, we "will not reverse a discretionary judgment of the trial court unless it affirmatively appears that such discretion has been explicitly abused to great injustice and injury of the party complaining". <u>Barnett v. Tennessee Orthopedic Alliance</u>, 391 S.W.3d 74 (Tenn.Ct.App. 2021)

Type of Sanctions

- 1. Deny request for relief
- 2. Disallow evidence
- 3. Strike claim or defense
- 4. Allow evidence at issue to be treated as contended by non-offending party
- 5. Protective order
- 6. Monetary award
- 7. Dismissal of case
- 8. Contempt of court

JUDICIAL STRUGGLES



JUDGE CAROL SOLOMAN

JUDICIAL STRUGGLES March 18, 2015

Judge Carol Soloman

- 1. Take special care not to be isolated. Stay involved with friends.
- 2. On emotional cases such as domestic, take frequent recesses. On recess talk to staff about light subjects or call a friend you have not talked to in a while.
- 3. My biggest mistake in contested domestic cases, I saw myself as the "Fixer" of all their problems. You cannot fix them; they often have emotional problems, above your pay grade.
- 4. Keep a complete list of cases you take under advisement along with the date you did so. Assign one member of your staff to remind you of all cases once or twice a week. Take care not to delay longer than 30 days.
- 5. Have regular meetings with other Judges in your district to discuss issues before they become problems and keep lines of communications open.
- 6. Keep all notes you write on all cases in order by date.
- 7. Don't allow people to speak to you about cases outside of Court. They usually don't understand that it's forbidden. One police officer that was my friend tried 3 or 4 times to speak to me about his daughters divorce. Even after being rebuffed all those times he tried again. I disclosed in the hearing what he had done and told him not to do it again. He still tried. I recused myself and called his Captain and made a report. Maybe he wanted me off her case but he was terminated from Metro Police Force.
- 8. Use experienced Judges for advice on problems or situations. They will be happy to give you useful information.
- 9. Be aware that once in a blue moon you will have a juror who took a drink or two at lunch break. Have Court Officers report to you any problems they detect. Deal with it swiftly.

- 10. Always disclose when your campaign treasurer appears before you. Until recently Judges signed blank campaign disclosure forms. Ask your staff to remind you as you cannot correct something you forget.
- II. If you feel you have a strong emotional response to a party, witness or attorney in non-jury trials, recuse yourself. We are human after all and have people before us that we strongly like or dislike, on a day to day basis. If it gets in your way of making fair decisions "recuse."
- 12. Ask a dear and trusted friend to be honest with you and tell you if you catch the dreaded disease "ROBE FEVER".

SELF-REPRESENTED LITIGANTS



JUDGE SKIP FRIERSON

Self-Represented Litigants: Addressing the Challenges

Tennessee Judicial Conference, Murfreesboro, Tennessee

March 18, 2015



Judge Thomas R. Frierson, II Tennessee Court of Appeals, E.S.

Self-Represented Litigants: Addressing the Challenges

Tennessee Judicial Conference, Murfreesboro, Tennessee March 18, 2015

General Outline1

I. Current Developments

A. National Center for State Courts

One of the biggest challenges in the court system is the increasing number of self-represented litigants. As the number of self-represented litigants in civil cases continues to grow, courts are responding by improving access to justice and making courts more user-friendly. Innovations include:

- ♦ simplifying court forms,
- providing one-on-one assistance,
- developing guides, handbooks, and instructions on how to proceed,
- offering court-sponsored legal advice,
- developing court-based self-help centers,
- collaborating with libraries and legal services,
- ♦ and using Internet technologies to increase access.

This has not only empowered people to solve their own problems and improved the public's trust and confidence in the courts, but has likewise benefited the courts through improved caseflow and increased quality of information presented to judges.²

B. Tennessee Access to Justice Commission 2014 Strategic Plan

1. Goals

This 2014 Strategic Plan also sets forth additional goals and initiatives to aid and expedite the Supreme Court's dynamic and ongoing Access to Justice campaign. In particular, the

¹ The text included in the body of this outline represents applicable quotations from the sources identified by footnote at the end of each section or subpart.

² National Center for State Courts, <u>Self-Representation Resource Guide</u>, http://www.NCSC.org/Topics/Access-and-Fairness/Self-Representation/Resource-Guide.aspx.

2014 Plan focuses on the Commission's first goal, which is to involve more lawyers and law students in meeting legal needs so that the public is better served. Key to the implementation of this goal is a more comprehensive pro bono delivery system across the state, which has taken shape through the establishment of 1-888-aLEGALz and the publication of the annual pro bono report. This 2014 Plan also addresses the necessity of further public outreach and awareness of existing access to justice resources for self-represented individuals and the community at large. Finally, the 2014 Plan addresses the Commission's commitment to careful measurement of the effectiveness of our collaborative efforts in order to assist stakeholders in directing resources to the programs that most effectively address the critical needs of our citizens.³

2. Videos/Forms

Assistance to Self-Represented Litigants. The Commission has produced a series of educational videos for self-represented litigants. It has developed and recommended plain-language forms for self-represented litigants and has expanded the available divorce forms to include forms for the uncontested divorce of parties with minor children. It has also developed plain-language resources regarding child support guidelines.⁴

3. Programs

Working with the General Sessions Judges Conference, the Commission has examined and made recommendations to increase attorney involvement in helping otherwise self-represented individuals through Attorney-of-the-Day programs and other limited-scope representation initiatives in the General Sessions courts.⁵

Transesse Access to Justice Commission (ATJC), 2014 Strategic Plan, pages 1 and 2, www.tncourts.gov/sites/default/files/docs/final_2014_strategic_plan_and_appendices.pdf.

⁴ Id. at 6.

^{5,,}

4. Bench Book

Also, in collaboration with the Tennessee General Sessions Judges Conference, a General Sessions court pro se bench book, "Meeting the Challenges of Self-Represented Litigants," has been created and circulated and is now being used as a model for the creation of a Circuit and Chancery Court Pro Se Bench Book.⁶

II. Establishing a Proactive Approach

A challenge for judges in seeking justice in their courts increasingly involves the issue of how to interact with self-represented litigants. There is a growing and accepted school of thought that a judge must be pro-active in seeking and adopting policies and procedures that are friendly to all parties, including those represented by counsel and those representing themselves. Many authorities now recognize, as does the Tennessee Supreme Court, that for a judge to do nothing to address the needs or problems faced by self-represented litigants actually advances injustice and contributes to the loss of respect for the judicial system by a substantial portion of the public.⁷

III. Creating a Self-Represented Litigant Bench Book

Many articles and documents have been formulated across the United States and beyond on these issues. This Benchbook is intended to be informative and concise for the busy judge. It recognizes that judges must balance many cases every day and use their discretion to make decisions, while at the same time considering rules of procedure, rules of evidence, and judicial ethics. Judges also have their own styles, and courts have their own culture.⁸

IV. Establishing Local Guidelines and Handouts

The local guidelines can describe for all litigants and attorneys the policies

^{6&}lt;sub>Id.</sub>

⁷ Meeting the Challenges of Self-Represented Litigants, a Benchbook for General Sessions Judges of the State of Tennessee. May 2013, Introduction, page 1, www.tncourts.gov/sites/default/files/docs/final_pro_se_benchbook_-_May_2013,pdf.

⁸ Id.

and procedures of the local court system. The guidelines can and should also address specific issues dealing with self-represented litigants, including:

- (1) <u>The importance of considering the use of legal counsel</u> prior to filing an action in court or after being served with court process on a case.
- (2) A brief explanation of local procedures in court. These can include:
 - (a) Calling of the docket
 - (b) Dress code expectations and rules regarding cell phones, proper court etiquette, emphasis on need to be on time, etc.
 - (c) Need to have <u>live witnesses</u> and not just written reports.
 - (d) Exchange of exhibits with opposing side prior to beginning of trial or hearing.
 - (e) Simple terminology of courts.
 - (f) <u>Procedures of plaintiff's case</u> and direct examination and cross examination, followed by <u>procedures of defendant's</u> case, etc.⁹

V. Coordination with Court Clerks

Judges and clerks should coordinate and understand limitations of clerks and their staffs, along with judicial secretaries or administrators. The Guidelines for Tennessee Court Clerks Who Assist Self-Represented Persons should be followed by all clerks and their personnel, which allows clerks to assist the public in a cordial and pleasant manner without providing legal advice.¹⁰

VI. Establishing a Proper Judicial Greeting

A. General Considerations

- 1. Be courteous and respectful to all parties.
- 2. Be in control of your courtroom but realize achieving justice in each case is a work-in-progress. Use your ability, training and common sense to deal with all parties, whether represented by counsel or not. You are here for

⁹Id. at 2 (emphasis in original).

¹⁰ Id. at 5.

a season, and you are a servant of the people who elected you and the Constitution and laws that guide you. Enjoy the experience and honor, and advance the cause of justice.¹¹

B. Specific Initiatives

- 1. Do not make comments or use a tone and manner that are rude, intimidating, harsh, threatening, angry, sarcastic, discouraging, belittling, humiliating, or disdainful.
- 2. Do not interrupt self-represented litigants unless necessary to control proceedings or prevent discourtesy.
- 3. Do not engage in protracted dialogues or make off-hand, negative comments regarding their pro se status.
- 4. Address self-represented litigants with titles comparable to those used for counsel.
- 5. Avoid over-familiar conduct toward attorneys (for example, using first names, sharing in-jokes, referring to other proceedings or bar events, inviting attorneys into chambers, chatting casually before or after court proceedings).¹²

VII. Establishing an Introductory Script

- A. Give a basic introduction to courtroom protocol, for example, the importance of timeliness, checking in with the clerk (if that is necessary), who sits where, directing arguments to you, not other parties or attorneys, rising when you enter, and other matters you consider important (attire, gum chewing, reading while court is in session, etc.).¹³
- B. Explain the prohibition on ex parte communications (you cannot talk to one side without the other side being present

¹¹ Id. at 6.

¹² Cynthia Gray, 66 Reaching Out or Overreaching: Judicial Ethics and Self-Represented Litigants," American Judicature Society, 16-17 (2005), available at www.courts.ca.gov/partners/documents/ReachingOutOverreaching.pdf.

¹³ Id. at 28.

and litigants cannot file any papers with the court that are not served on the other side).¹⁴

VIII. Limited Scope Representation Programs

A. "LAWYER OF THE DAY" PROGRAMS:

Use of "lawyer of the day" or similar programs are specifically endorsed as ethically acceptable as long as they operate within the confines of ethical rules and guidelines.

Any lawyer operating within a "lawyer of the day" program should, of course, avoid real conflicts of interest, improper contact with parties, and other ethical violations.

As long as the self-represented party understands the limitations under which a "lawyer of the day" is operating, such limited roles of lawyers are acceptable ethically. This includes advising litigants of court procedures and rules of evidence, attempts to resolve or mediate issues, and other simple acts of representation or "unbundled services." ¹⁵

B. "LEGAL ADVICE CLINICS":

Pro bono legal advice clinics are where lawyers meet with pro se litigants and give advice on what to do or what not to do, or advise litigants of what to expect in court, and provide other valuable legal and common sense advice.¹⁶

C. "PRO SE DOCKET DAY":

Where lawyers are assigned on a rotating basis to assist pro se parties on what is clearly explained to be a <u>one-day event</u> only.

"Pro Se Docket Days" can also be a time when judges have a day of special instructions for people representing

¹⁴ Id. at 52.

¹⁵ Meeting the Challenges of Self-Represented Litigants, a Benchbook for General Sessions Judges of the State of Tennessee, May 2013, page 3, www.tncourts.gov/sites/default/files/docs/final_pro_se_benchbook_-_may_2013.pdf.

^{16&}lt;sub>Id at 3</sub>

themselves where courts can give explanations of judicial expectations, simple rules of evidence and procedure, and assist self-represented parties in having a greater understanding of what is going to happen in court.¹⁷

IX. Judicial Ethics Opinions

Requests for Formal Ethics Opinions are controlled by Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 10A.

X. Additional Resources

A. Access to Justice Coordinator

Anne-Louise Wirthlin
Access to Justice Coordinator
Administrative Office of the Courts
511 Union Street, Suite 600
Nashville, TN 37219
615-741-2687
615-741-6285 (fax)

B. Judicial Resources

http://www.tncourts.gov/administration/judicial-resources/forms-documents/other-forms-resources

Accompanying Guidelines and Helpful Information for People With Cases in GS Court http://www.tncourts.gov/programs/self-help-center/

C. Court Clerks' Guidelines

http://www.tncourts.gov/courts/court-clerks/clerks-manuals-reporting

D. Access to Justice

www.JusticeForAllTN.com website guide - This is a guide to all of the resources that are available on the Court's ATJ website.

¹⁷ Id. at 5.

E. General Resources¹⁸

- 1. "Ethics in Transition: Unrepresented Litigants and the Changing Judicial Role," by Russell Engler, Notre Dame Journal of Law, Ethics and Public Policy, Volume 22 Pages 367-398 (June 2008)
- 2. "Ensuring Access to Justice in Tough Economic Times," by Frank Broccolina and Richard Zorza, <u>Judicature</u>, Volume 92, No. III (November-December, 2008)
- 3. "Judicial Techniques for Cases Involving Self-Represented Litigants," by Rebecca Albrecht, John M. Greacen, Bonnie Rose Hough, and Richard Zorza, <u>The Judges Journal</u> (Winter 2003 American Bar Association Volume 42, No. 1)
- 4. "Litigants without Lawyers: Courts and Lawyers Meeting the Challenge of Self-Representation" (American Bar Associations Coalition for Justice Roadmap Series, 2002)
- 5. "Guidelines for Tennessee Court Clerks Who Assist Self-Represented Persons" (Tennessee State Court Clerks Association)
- 6. "Report to the Tennessee Supreme Court of the Task Force to Study Self-Represented Litigant Issues in Tennessee" (December 4, 2007, Carl A. Pierce, Chairperson) 7. "In a Downturn, More Act as Their Own Lawyers," by
- Jonathan D. Glater, The New York Times (April 10, 2009)
 8. "The Toughest Nut: Handling Cases Pitting Unrepresented
- Litigants Against Represented Ones," by Russell Engler,
 National Council of Juvenile and Family Court Judges,
 Volume 62, No. 1 (Winter 2011)
- 9. "Reaching Out or Overreaching: Judicial Ethics and Self-Represented Litigants," by Cynthia Gray (American Judicature Society, 2005)
- 10. "The Disconnect Between the Requirements of Judicial Neutrality and Those of the Appearance of Neutrality when Parties Appear Pro Se: Causes, Solutions, Recommendations, and Implications," by Richard Zorza, Georgetown Journal of Legal Ethics, Volume 17, pages 423-454 (2004)
- 11. "Rethinking the Rules of Evidentiary Admissibility in

¹⁸ Id. at 12.

Non-Jury Trials," by John Sheldon and Peter Murray,

<u>Judicature</u>, Volume 86, No. 5 (March-April 2003)

12. "A New Day for Judges and the Self-Represented:

Toward Best Practices in Complex Self-Represented Cases,"

by Richard Zorza, <u>The Judges' Journal</u>, Vol. 51 No. 1

(Winter 2012), by The American Bar Association

C:\Users\AOC User\Documents\Self Rep Litigants March 2015\SelfRepresented Litigants Prosentation FINAL2.doc

PRETRIAL PREPARATION



JUDGE EDDIE BECKNER

CHECK LISTS:

- Prepare a check list or outline for every issue, except the simplest, that requires finding of facts and conclusions of law;
- One of your own creation will be more valuable than a canned one;
- These will be especially important when ruling from the bench, to help you be clear, concise, convincing, and correct in your decision;
- For this purpose you can use any electronic device, but a loose leaf binder is best for availability and accessibility wherever you are;
- Your documents should contain relevant citations and exerts from applicable authority. Use the language of the cases in your rulings.

PRETRIAL PREPARATION (JURY TRIALS):

- Don't wait until trial date to make any decisions that can be made prior to trial:
- Schedule pretrial hearings to determine admissibility of all evidence of which it is anticipated questions will arise;
- Determine the admissibility of all exhibits before trial. Have the images of all exhibits, admitted and excluded, placed in an "Image Book" with copies for all interested parties, and which can be sent up on appeal. Load the admitted images into a computer to be shown on a large screen to the jury and on monitors for the judge and counsel.
- Handle all Media issues before trial if possible. Following Rule30 of the Rules of the Supreme Court of Tennessee, you may choose to only allow one TV video camera and one still camera in the courtroom. The cameras should be required to be on a tripod and not using lights or flash. Devise a fair method of selecting the cameras in the courtroom. All other TV cameras can plug into a feed in a media area outside the courtroom. The print media can all be passed the card, chip, etc. from the courtroom camera to load into their computers. You should have a pretrial meeting with all interested media in which you can carefully explain the rules and procedures and get input from them. Persuade the local parking

- authorities to provide parking spaces for satellite trucks. File written orders to document all final decisions.
- Research pretrial by reading through all pleadings and determining what
 issues you will be required to decide. Upon researching these issues,
 make enough notes and copies of authority that you will feel comfortable
 hearing the issues and deciding them based on authority you can cite
 from your notes. Of course part of the input you will want should come
 from requiring counsel to submit briefs.